

**U.S. District Court  
North Carolina Middle District (NCMD)  
CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 1:24-mc-00027-UA-JEP**

CITY OF BREVARD, NORTH CAROLINA et al v. HCA  
HEALTHCARE, INC. et al  
Assigned to: UNASSIGNED  
Referred to: MAG/JUDGE JOI ELIZABETH PEAKE  
Case in other court: Western District of North Carolina, 1:22CV114  
Cause: no cause specified

Date Filed: 11/12/2024

**Plaintiff**

**CITY OF ASHEVILLE, NORTH  
CAROLINA**

represented by **JOHN F. BLOSS , SR.**  
HIGGINS BENJAMIN, PLLC  
301 N. ELM STREET, STE. 800  
GREENSBORO, NC 27401  
336-273-1600  
Fax: 336-274-4650  
Email: [jbloss@greensborolaw.com](mailto:jbloss@greensborolaw.com)  
**LEAD ATTORNEY**  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Plaintiff**

**BUNCOMBE COUNTY, NORTH  
CAROLINA**

represented by **JOHN F. BLOSS , SR.**  
(See above for address)  
**LEAD ATTORNEY**  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Plaintiff**

**MADISON COUNTY**

represented by **JOHN F. BLOSS , SR.**  
(See above for address)  
**LEAD ATTORNEY**  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Plaintiff**

**CITY OF BREVARD, NORTH CAROLINA**

represented by **JOHN F. BLOSS , SR.**  
(See above for address)  
**LEAD ATTORNEY**  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

V.

**Defendant**

**HCA HEALTHCARE, INC.**

represented by **PHILLIP T. JACKSON**  
ROBERTS & STEVENS, P.A.  
POB 7647  
ASHEVILLE, NC 28802-7647  
828-252-6600

Fax: 828-258-6955  
Email: pjackson@roberts-stevens.com  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**BRYANT CROSS**  
ROBERTS & STEVENS, P.A.  
301 COLLEGE STREET  
SUITE 400  
ASHEVILLE, NC 28801  
269-312-5784  
Email: bcross@roberts-stevens.com  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Defendant**

**HCA MANAGEMENT SERVICES, LP**

represented by **PHILLIP T. JACKSON**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Defendant**

**MH MASTER HOLDINGS, LLLP**

represented by **PHILLIP T. JACKSON**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Defendant**

**MH HOSPITAL MANAGER, LLC**

represented by **PHILLIP T. JACKSON**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Defendant**

**MH MISSION HOSPITAL, LLLP**

represented by **PHILLIP T. JACKSON**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Defendant**

**MISSION HOSPITAL, INC.**

represented by **DANA C. LUMSDEN**  
BRADLEY ARANT BOULT CUMMINGS  
LLP  
214 NORTH TRYON STREET, SUITE 3700  
CHARLOTTE, NC 28202  
704-338-6034  
Fax: 704-332-8858  
Email: dlumsden@bradley.com  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Defendant**

**ANC HEALTHCARE, INC.**  
*formerly known as*  
**MISSION HEALTH SYSTEM, INC.**

represented by **DANA C. LUMSDEN**  
(See above for address)  
**LEAD ATTORNEY**  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Defendant**

**HCA, INC.**

represented by **PHILLIP T. JACKSON**  
(See above for address)  
**LEAD ATTORNEY**  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Interested Party**

**STATE OF NC**

represented by **TIFFANY Y. LUCAS**  
N.C. DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE  
114 W. EDENTON STREET  
RALEIGH, NC 27603  
919-716-6920  
Fax: 919-716-6764  
Email: tlucas@ncdoj.gov  
**LEAD ATTORNEY**  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Interested Party**

**PRIME HEALTH SERVICES**

represented by **GARY KENT SUE**  
SUE & ANDERSON, LLP  
419 N. ELM STREET  
GREENSBORO, NC 27401  
336-275-0512  
Email: gks@sa-nclaw.com  
**LEAD ATTORNEY**  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Movant**

**CHARLOTTE-MECKLENBURG  
HOSPITAL AUTHORITY**

represented by **JAZZMIN ROMERO**  
ROBINSON, BRADSHAW AND HINSON  
101 N. TRYON ST.  
STE 1900  
CHARLOTTE, NC 28246  
704-377-8163  
Email: jromero@robinsonbradshaw.com  
**LEAD ATTORNEY**  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**NATHAN C. CHASE , JR.**  
ROBINSON BRADSHAW & HINSON, P.A.  
101 N. TRYON ST., STE. 1900  
CHARLOTTE, NC 28246-1900  
704-377-8383  
Fax: 704-373-3983  
Email: nchase@robinsonbradshaw.com  
**LEAD ATTORNEY**  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

Date Filed	#	Docket Text
11/12/2024	<u>1</u>	MOTION to Compel Discovery by HCA Healthcare, Inc., HCA Management Services, LP, MH Master Holdings, LLLP, MH Hospital Manager, LLC, MH Mission Hospital, LLLP. Response to Motion due by 11/26/2024 (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A to Motion to Compel)(JACKSON, PHILLIP) (Entered: 11/12/2024)
11/12/2024	<u>2</u>	BRIEF re <u>1</u> MOTION to Compel Discovery by Movants HCA Healthcare, Inc., HCA Management Services, LP, MH Master Holdings, LLLP, MH Hospital Manager, LLC, MH Mission Hospital, LLLP filed by HCA Healthcare, Inc., HCA Management Services, LP, MH Master Holdings, LLLP, MH Hospital Manager, LLC, MH Mission Hospital, LLLP. (JACKSON, PHILLIP) (Entered: 11/12/2024)
11/12/2024	<u>3</u>	DECLARATION of <i>Phillip T. Jackson in Support of MTC</i> by Movants HCA Healthcare, Inc., HCA Management Services, LP, MH Master Holdings, LLLP, MH Hospital Manager, LLC, MH Mission Hospital, LLLP. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A, # <u>2</u> Exhibit C, # <u>3</u> Exhibit D, # <u>4</u> Exhibit E, # <u>5</u> Exhibit F, # <u>6</u> Exhibit G, # <u>7</u> Exhibit H, # <u>8</u> Exhibit I)(JACKSON, PHILLIP) (Entered: 11/12/2024)
11/12/2024	<u>4</u>	MOTION to Transfer Case by HCA Healthcare, Inc., HCA Management Services, LP, MH Master Holdings, LLLP, MH Hospital Manager, LLC, MH Mission Hospital, LLLP. Response to Motion due by 12/3/2024 (JACKSON, PHILLIP) (Entered: 11/12/2024)
11/12/2024	<u>5</u>	BRIEF re <u>4</u> MOTION to Transfer Case by Movants HCA Healthcare, Inc., HCA Management Services, LP, MH Master Holdings, LLLP, MH Hospital Manager, LLC, MH Mission Hospital, LLLP filed by HCA Healthcare, Inc., HCA Management Services, LP, MH Master Holdings, LLLP, MH Hospital Manager, LLC, MH Mission Hospital, LLLP. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B, # <u>3</u> Exhibit C)(JACKSON, PHILLIP) (Entered: 11/12/2024)
11/14/2024	<u>1</u>	Receipt of Funds in the amount of \$ 52.00. Receipt #5902. (sh) (Entered: 11/14/2024)
11/15/2024	<u>6</u>	NOTICE of Attorney Appearance by attorney NATHAN C. CHASE, JR on behalf of Movant CHARLOTTE-MECKLENBURG HOSPITAL AUTHORITY (CHASE, NATHAN) (Entered: 11/15/2024)
11/15/2024	<u>7</u>	NOTICE of Attorney Appearance by attorney JAZZMIN ROMERO on behalf of Movant CHARLOTTE-MECKLENBURG HOSPITAL AUTHORITY (ROMERO, JAZZMIN) (Entered: 11/15/2024)
11/15/2024	<u>8</u>	MOTION for Extension of Time to File Response/Reply as to <u>1</u> MOTION to Compel Discovery by CHARLOTTE-MECKLENBURG HOSPITAL AUTHORITY. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order)(CHASE, NATHAN) (Entered: 11/15/2024)
11/19/2024	<u>9</u>	NOTICE of Attorney Appearance by attorney BRYANT CROSS on behalf of Defendant HCA HEALTHCARE, INC. (CROSS, BRYANT) (Entered: 11/19/2024)
11/20/2024	<u>1</u>	Case Assigned to UNASSIGNED and MAG/JUDGE JOI ELIZABETH PEAKE. (km) (Entered: 11/20/2024)
11/20/2024	<u>10</u>	RESPONSE re <u>8</u> MOTION for Extension of Time to File Response/Reply as to <u>1</u> MOTION to Compel Discovery filed by HCA HEALTHCARE, INC.. Replies due by 12/4/2024 (CROSS, BRYANT) (Entered: 11/20/2024)
11/21/2024	<u>1</u>	Motions Referred: RE: <u>8</u> MOTION for Extension of Time to File Response/Reply as to <u>1</u> MOTION to Compel Discovery , to MAG/JUDGE JOI ELIZABETH PEAKE (ww) (Entered: 11/21/2024)
11/26/2024	<u>11</u>	RESPONSE in Opposition re <u>1</u> MOTION to Compel Discovery filed by MH MASTER HOLDINGS, LLLP, HCA HEALTHCARE, INC., HCA MANAGEMENT SERVICES, LP, MH

		MISSION HOSPITAL, LLLP, MH HOSPITAL MANAGER, LLC filed by CHARLOTTE–MECKLENBURG HOSPITAL AUTHORITY. Replies due by 12/10/2024 (CHASE, NATHAN) (Entered: 11/26/2024)
11/26/2024	<u>12</u>	DECLARATION of Paul M. Sacksteder filed by Movant CHARLOTTE–MECKLENBURG HOSPITAL AUTHORITY re <u>11</u> Response in Opposition to Motion, filed by CHARLOTTE–MECKLENBURG HOSPITAL AUTHORITY. (CHASE, NATHAN) (Entered: 11/26/2024)
12/03/2024	<u>13</u>	RESPONSE filed by Movant CHARLOTTE–MECKLENBURG HOSPITAL AUTHORITY re <u>4</u> MOTION to Transfer Case filed by MH MASTER HOLDINGS, LLLP, HCA HEALTHCARE, INC., HCA MANAGEMENT SERVICES, LP, MH MISSION HOSPITAL, LLLP, MH HOSPITAL MANAGER, LLC filed by CHARLOTTE–MECKLENBURG HOSPITAL AUTHORITY. Replies due by 12/17/2024 (CHASE, NATHAN) (Entered: 12/03/2024)
12/03/2024	<u>14</u>	REPLY, filed by Defendant HCA HEALTHCARE, INC., to Response to <u>1</u> MOTION to Compel Discovery filed by HCA HEALTHCARE, INC.. (CROSS, BRYANT) (Entered: 12/03/2024)
12/04/2024	<u>15</u>	<b>ORDER</b> signed by MAG/JUDGE JOI ELIZABETH PEAKE on 12/4/2024, that the Motion to Transfer [Doc. # <u>4</u> ] is GRANTED by consent, and this matter is transferred to the United States District Court for the Western District of North Carolina where the underlying action is pending. (lg) (Entered: 12/04/2024)